# ISD 535 Rochester Education Finance Analysis School Funding, Inflation & Student Performance

Ken Wolf & Bob Fallen Revised: July 17, 2024



## **About The Authors**

**Ken Wolf:** A former state legislator (R, Burnsville) and recognized expert in education finance who served as a member of the Education Finance Committee. Wolf published several papers addressing school finance and was appointed Chairman of the Subcommittee on Government Efficiency and Oversight.

**Bob Fallen:** Founder of *Local Elections Matter* with a mission to inform citizens about local school board governance processes and to motivate greater public engagement and amplification of matters that impact K-12 school districts.

## GOP lawmaker disputes claim that state 'underfunds' schools

S tate Rep. Ken attempting a difficult task – to explain Minnesota's arcane education finance system to the masses and to refute the claim

refute the claim that state aid has not kept pace with inflation. In an eight-page newsletter to his

district, the Burnsville Republican contends that unrestricted state aid to school districts has

exceeded inflation by 9 percent since 1991. He says total state aid — including money earmarked for specific purposes — has exceeded inflation by 14 percent during the same eight-year period. Wolf, who serves on the House school

finance committee, says he prepared the newsletter because he got tired of hearing school officials say that "the state has 'underfunded education year after

#### Wolf's report makes important distinctions To the editor:

Rep. Ken Wolf's (R-Burnsville) recent report, "Education Finance," has received a lot of attention, as it should.

If we are going to effectively involve parents and individual teachers in improving student achievement then we must ensure they have useful information. In the world of education finance and arguments over school funding, it's easy for people to throw around enough figures and accusations to confuse a brain surgeon.

Most people agree teacher compensation takes up the majority of any school district's budget. And, as illustrated by the trade-offs made by the St. Paul School District, we often end up having to decide between educational program offerings and differing levels of teacher pay raises.

To make the most informed decisions, we need to be able to distinguish between the increases actually received by individual teachers and the increase in the overall salary schedule. Generally, compensation for individual teachers exceeds the increase in the salary schedule.

year,' especially in the years Arne Carison was governor." "I took it kind of personally," he says. Wolf, a former computer program and a numbers whit, supports his assertions with a series of charts and graphs illustrating how the system works and how state support for schools has risen. He also contends that the system has been slightly more generous for the Burnsville district than for school districts

statewide. Duane Benson, president of the Minnesota Business Parinership and a former state senator, praises Wolf's newsletter as "almost revolutionary in this day and age. He's saying to his constituents: "Stay with me now. Tim going to take a complicated issue and Tim going to try to explain it." Officials of state education groups and base of the state education groups and officials of state education groups and of the state education groups and of

the Burnsville school district express doubts about the accuracy of some of Wolf's numbers, but to date they have offered none of their own. Wolf's newsletter went out over the-

Memorial Day weekend as Burnsville

School District 191 and a number of suburban districts like it were beginning to grapple with some difficult budget problems for the coming year. Although the Minnesota School Boards

Although the Minnesota School Boarts Association has heralded the \$7.9-billion school aid package passed by the 1999 Legislature as the most generous in a decade, a number of districts are talking about the need to lay off teachers and make other "budget cuts."

#### Rep. Ken Wolf is attempting the impossible – to explain to constituents how Minnesota's arcane education funding

system works.

In most cases, these "cuts" are not really cuts at all — but reductions in the spending increases that districts would like to make.

The main reason for the budget problems in many districts is that they have flat or declining enrollments. The bulk of state aid is distributed on a per-pupil

But the Legislature did increase the amount of per-pupil aid by 4.7 percent in the first year of the biennium and 3.2 percent in the second year. It also provided a 'partial cushion for districts with declining enrollments. And it approved

Rep. Wolf's report did a marvelous job at making that important distinction. Next time your local school board announces a salary settlement calling for yearly compensation increases of 2.8 and 2.7 percent, you can ask if that is for individual teachers or for the salary schedule. By boiling it down to the impact on individual teachers, we can more accurately discuss if it was enough.

Rep. Wolf's report, combined with other legislative changes are making it possible for parents and teachers to better understand the issues of student achievement and school funding. Ultimately, our children will be the ones who will benefit from these efforts.

Duane Benson Executive Director of Minnesota Business Partnership

## ISD 535 Rochester Education Funding vs. Inflation (CPI)

While many advance the narrative of "school funding has not kept pace with inflation", data from the Minnesota Department of Education (MDE) shows this is demonstrably false. From 2013 to 2023, not only did "Basic" funding <u>exceed inflation</u> in ISD 535, **Combined Revenue exceeded CPI by 32.4%**. Over that same period, **per-pupil funding went from \$ 9,754 to \$ 14,399, an increase of \$4,645** for every student in the district, a growth rate of 47.6%.

Understandably, the public does not fully grasp the nuances of K-12 finance, and when they are told that K12 funding has lagged inflation, they assume the statement to be based in fact. However, strictly looking at the "Basic Formula" does not represent a complete picture of education funding and provides a misleading story communicated to the tax-paying public. The true measure of school funding is the Combined Revenue reported by MDE, that combines State Aid and Local Levies. This is the only way to get a complete picture of the adequacy of education funding on a district-by-district and statewide basis.

Cost structures for school districts vary, with many nuances and variables related to expenditures. However, the following information is based 100% on factual data available to the public.

## ISD 535 Rochester 20-Year Total Funding vs Inflation (CPI)

| Description                    | FY 2003     | FY 2023     | # CHANGE    | %<br>CHANGE | NOTES   |
|--------------------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|---|
| Average Daily Membership (ADM) | 16,101      | 17,313      | 1,212       | 7.53%       | Student population increased by 7.5%, from 2003 to 2023.        |
| Consumer Price Index (CPI)     | 183.96      | 292.66      | 108.70      | 59.09%      | CPI increased 2.95 percent per year                             |
|                                |             |             |             |             |   |
| Basic Education Fund           | 86,489,874  | 129,948,160 | 43,458,286  | 50.25%      | Basic increased 2.51% per year, under CPI by 0.44%              |
| Other General Education        | 17,450,618  | 51,894,216  | 34,443,598  | 197.38%     | Other increased 9.87% per year, over CPI by 6.91%               |
| General Education Total        | 103,940,492 | 181,842,376 | 77,901,884  | 74.95%      | General Education increased 3.75% per year, over CPI by 0.79%   |
|                                |             |             |             |             |   |
| Special Education Fund         | 9,600,669   | 40,660,555  | 31,059,886  | 323.52%     | Special Education increased 16.18% per year, over CPI by 13.22% |
| Other Funds                    | 14,411,974  | 26,786,185  | 12,374,211  | 85.86%      | Other increased 4.29% per year, over CPI by 1.34%               |
| Combined Revenue               | 127,953,135 | 249,289,116 | 121,335,981 | 94.83%      | Combined Revenue increased 4.74% per year, over CPI by 1.79%    |
|                                |             |             |             |             |   |
| Combined Aid (State)           | 109,559,982 | 194,062,895 | 84,502,913  | 77.13%      | State Aid increased 3.86% per year, over CPI by 0.90%           |
| Combined Levies (Local)        | 18,393,153  | 55,226,221  | 36,833,068  | 200.25%     | Local Levies increased 10.01% per year, over CPI by 7.06%       |
| Total Combined Revenue         | 127,953,135 | 249,289,116 | 121,335,981 | 94.83%      | Combined Revenue increased 4.74% per year, over CPI by 1.79%    |

#### **Key Findings**

• Combined Revenue for ISD 535 Rochester exceeded inflation (CPI) by 35.74% (1.79% per year) for the past 20 years (2003-23).

- In 2003, Combined Revenue in ISD 535 Rochester consisted of Basic (68%), Other General Ed (14%), Special Ed (8%) and Other Funds (11%).
- In 2023, Combined Revenue in ISD 535 Rochester consisted of Basic (52%), Other General Ed (21%), Special Ed (16%) and Other Funds (11%). 4

## ISD 535 Rochester 10-Year Total Funding vs Inflation (CPI)

| Description                    | FY 2013     | FY 2023     | # CHANGE   | %<br>CHANGE | NOTES   |
|--------------------------------|-------------|-------------|------------|-------------|---|
| Average Daily Membership (ADM) | 16,173      | 17,313      | 1,140      | 7.05        | Student population increased by 7.05%, from 2013 to 2023.       |
| Consumer Price Index (CPI)     | 232.95      | 292.66      | 59.70      | 25.63%      | CPI Increased 2.56 percent per year                             |
|                                |             |             |            |             |   |
| Basic Education Fund           | 96,970,030  | 129,948,160 | 32,978,130 | 34.01%      | Basic increased 3.40% per year, over CPI by 0.84%               |
| Other General Education        | 26,339,118  | 51,894,216  | 25,555,098 | 97.02%      | Other increased 9.70% per year, over CPI by 7.14%               |
| General Education Total        | 123,309,148 | 181,842,376 | 58,533,228 | 47.47%      | General Education increased 4.75% per year, over CPI by 2.18%   |
|                                |             |             |            |             |   |
| Special Education Fund         | 15,517,619  | 40,660,555  | 25,142,936 | 162.03%     | Special Education increased 16.20% per year, over CPI by 13.64% |
| Other Funds                    | 18,921,184  | 26,786,185  | 7,865,001  | 41.57%      | Other increased 4.16% per year, over CPI by 1.59%               |
| Combined Revenue               | 157,747,951 | 249,289,116 | 91,541,165 | 58.03%      | Combined Revenue increased 5.80% per year, over CPI by 3.24%    |
|                                |             |             |            |             |   |
| Combined Aid (State)           | 128,426,017 | 194,062,895 | 65,636,878 | 51.11%      | State Aid increased 5.11% per year, over CPI by 2.55%           |
| Combined Levies (Local)        | 29,321,934  | 55,226,221  | 25,904,287 | 88.34%      | Local Levies increased 8.83% per year, over CPI by 6.27%        |
| Total Combined Revenue         | 157,747,951 | 249,289,116 | 91,541,165 | 58.03%      | Combined Revenue increased 5.80% per year, over CPI by 3.24%    |

#### **Key Findings**

• Combined Revenue for ISD 535 Rochester exceeded inflation by 32.4% for the past 10 years (2013-23), (3.24% per year).

- In 2013, Combined Revenue in ISD 535 Rochester consisted of Basic (61%), Other General Ed (17%), Special Ed (10%) and Other Funds (12%).
- In 2023, Combined Revenue In ISD 535 Rochester consisted of Basic (52%), Other General Ed (21%), Special Ed (16%) and Other Funds (11%). 5

## ISD 535 Rochester 10-Year Per-Pupil Funding vs Inflation (CPI)

| Description                    | FY 2013 | FY 2023 | # CHANGE | %<br>CHANGE | NOTES   |
|--------------------------------|---------|---------|----------|-------------|---|
| Average Daily Membership (ADM) | 16,173  | 17,313  | 1,140    | 7.05%       | Student population increased by 7.05%, from 2013 to 2023.       |
| Consumer Price Index (CPI)     | 232.96  | 292.66  | 59.70    | 25.63%      | CPI Increased 2.56 percent per year                             |
|                                |         |         |          |             |   |
| Basic Education Fund           | 5,996   | 7,506   | 1,510    | 25.18%      | Basic increased 2.52% per year, under CPI by 0.04%              |
| Other General Education        | 1,628   | 2,997   | 1,369    | 84.09%      | Other increased 8.41% per year, over CPI by 5.85%               |
| General Education Total        | 7,624   | 10,503  | 2,879    | 37.76%      | General Education increased 3.78% per year, over CPI by 1.21%   |
|                                |         |         |          |             |   |
| Special Education Fund         | 959     | 2,349   | 1,390    | 144.94%     | Special Education increased 14.49% per year, over CPI by 11.93% |
| Other Funds                    | 1,171   | 1,547   | 376      | 32.11%      | Other increased 3.21% per year, over CPI by 0.65%               |
| Combined Revenue               | 9,754   | 14,399  | 4,645    | 47.62%      | Combined Revenue increased 4.76% per year, over CPI by 2.20%    |
|                                |         |         |          |             |   |
| Combined Aid (State)           | 7,941   | 11,209  | 3,268    | 41.15%      | State Aid increased 4.12% per year, over CPI by 1.55%           |
| Combined Levies (Local)        | 1,813   | 3,190   | 1,377    | 75.95%      | Local Levies increased 7.60% per year, over CPI by 5.03%        |
| Total Combined Revenue         | 9,754   | 14,399  | 4,645    | 47.62%      | Combined Revenue increased 4.76% per year, over CPI by 2.20%    |

#### **Key Findings**

• Combined Per-Pupil Revenue for ISD 535 Rochester exceeded inflation (CPI) by 22% (2.2% per year) for the past 10 years, 2013-23.

• Per-Pupil Funding for ISD 535 Rochester increased \$4,645 over the past 10 years, from \$9,754 to \$14,399, a jump of 47.6%.

### ISD 535 Rochester School Funding vs. Student Performance (MCAs)

Since 2013, per-pupil funding in ISD 535 Rochester <u>exceeded inflation by 32%</u> while scores of ISD 535 K-12 students on the Minnesota Comprehensive Assessment (MCA) tests declined by: Math (- 35%), Reading (- 16%) and Science (- 30%)

|         | 2013 | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 | 2018 | 2019 | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 |                |
|---------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|----------------|
| MATH    | 61.2 | 60.0 | 58.7 | 55.6 | 54.3 | 52.9 | 49.8 | 40.1 | 39.8 | 0.0  | - 35.0%        |
| READING | 58.7 | 59.5 | 59.8 | 59.6 | 57.5 | 57.3 | 55.5 | 51.4 | 49.5 | 0.0  | - 15.7%        |
| SCIENCE | 51.8 | 51.6 | 50.1 | 50.6 | 46.7 | 44.6 | 42.1 | 39.6 | 36.4 | 0.0  | - <b>29.8%</b> |

Note 1: MCA Testing Cancelled in 2020 Note 2: MCA for ISD 535 Not Available in 2023



SOURCE: Minnesota Department of Education "Report Card"

### ISD 535 Rochester School Funding vs. College Testing (ACTs)

Since 2013, ISD 535 Rochester per-pupil funding increased 48% while K-12 student test scores on the American College Test (ACT) declined by: -\_\_\_%

|             | 2013 | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 | 2018 | 2019 | 2020 | 2021 | 2022 |                |
|-------------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|----------------|
| ENGLISH     | 24.4 | 24.0 | 24.1 | 20.9 | 21.2 | 21.4 | 20.9 | 20.1 | 19.5 | 20.2 | - <b>17.2%</b> |
| MATH        | 25.1 | 25.0 | 24.4 | 22.0 | 22.5 | 22.2 | 21.8 | 21.3 | 20.9 | 20.7 | - 17.5%        |
| READING     | 25.0 | 24.9 | 24.9 | 22.0 | 22.2 | 22.6 | 22.0 | 21.8 | 21.8 | 22.1 | - 11.6%        |
| SCIENCE     | 24.5 | 24.5 | 24.1 | 21.7 | 22.3 | 22.3 | 21.9 | 21.4 | 21.3 | 21.3 | - <b>13.1%</b> |
| COMPOSITION | 24.9 | 24.7 | 24.5 | 21.8 | 22.2 | 22.3 | 21.8 | 21.3 | 21.0 | 21.2 | - 14.9%        |
| AVERAGE     | 24.8 | 24.6 | 24.4 | 21.7 | 22.1 | 22.2 | 21.7 | 21.2 | 20.9 | 21.1 | - 14.9%        |



**SOURCE: Minnesota Department of Education** 

## Addendum 1: Education Funding Sources in Minnesota

For decades, the education community in Minnesota has stated that school funding has lagged inflation. The current version of this sentiment is that *the basic general education formula has lagged inflation* for the past 20 years. The basis of this premise is rooted in the **Estimated General Fund State Aid and Levy Revenues**, published by the Minnesota Department of Education (MDE). The "Basic" formula is one of only six commonly used categories utilized to calculate school funding from state and local sources:

- 1) Basic Formula
- 2) General Education
- 3) Special Education
- 4) Combined Aid
- 5) Combined Levies
- 6) Combined Revenues

Basic represents the foundation of school district revenue, while Combined Revenues represent the total of state and local sources that fund public education. The term "basic general education formula" does not exist in the MDE database.

# Addendum 2: Commonly Used Funding Categories

**Basic Formula.** The base level of public school funding (state aid), representing 54% of Combined Revenues statewide in 2023, down from 70% in 2003.

Basic General Education. The same as Basic.

**General Education.** Combination of funds for the operations of the school district (state aid), representing 77% of Combined Revenue statewide in 2023, down from 84% in 2003.

**Combined Revenue.** The sum of all school funding from state aid and local levies, representing 100% of funding. The true measure of school funding.

**Combined Aid.** Revenue provided by State government sources (State Aid), representing 79% of Combined Revenue statewide in 2023, down from 92% in 2003.

**Combined Levies.** Revenue provided by Local government sources (Local Levies), representing 21% of Combined Revenue statewide in 2023, up from 8% in 2003.

## Addendum 3: Data Sources

### **School Revenue**

https://public.education.mn.gov/MDEAnalytics/DataTopic.jsp?TOPICID=43 Estimated General Fund State Aid and Levy Revenues, FY 2003 to FY 2025; End of Session Forecast

Financing Education in Minnesota (2022-23)

A Publication of the Minnesota House of Representatives, Fiscal Analysis Department, Solveig Beckel, Fiscal Analyst

Minnesota School Finance: A Guide for Legislators (2022), MN House Research, Tim Strom, Legislative Analyst

### ACT SCORES

https://public.education.mn.gov/MDEAnalytics/DataTopic.jsp?TOPICID=87

MCA TESTING Minnesota Department of Education: Public.education.mn.gov/MDEAnalytics/DataTopic.jsp?TOPICID=1 Minnesota Report Card (MDE)

### **Consumer Price Index (CPI) Data**

The CPI figures used are based on the Nov 2022 actual Consumer Price Index for All Items, All Urban Consumers as provided by the United States Bureau of Labor Statistics and estimates for 2023-2030 provided by Minnesota Management and Budget. https://www.bls.gov/cpi/tables/supplemental-files/